

Option not to block closing a parent issue when it has open subtask(s)

2022/05/09 18:30 - Admin Redmine

ステータス:	New	開始日:	2022/05/09
優先度:	通常	期日:	
担当者:		進捗率:	0%
カテゴリ:	Issues_2	予定工数:	0.00時間
対象バージョン:		作業時間:	0.00時間
Redmineorg_URL:	https://www.redmine.org/issues/28492	status_id:	1
category_id:	2	tracker_id:	2
version_id:	0	plus1:	0
issue_org_id:	28492	affected_version:	
author_id:	130529	closed_on:	
assigned_to_id:	0	affected_version_id:	
comments:	23		

説明
Hello,

I saw that: r16108.

But actually, it could be great to be able to close a parent task.
Is it possible to allow this in the "configuration" of Redmine? For example:

"Allow a parent tracker to be closed even if the sub-task aren't: YES/NO".

Thanks

journals

This is patch.

!issue-28492.png!

Toshi MARUYAMA wrote:

 This is patch.

 !issue-28492.png!

Thank you for writing the patch. The feature is beneficial for some users.

But I think it is better to change the setting name because "Close parent issue when its subtask is open" looks like a setting to automatically close parent issues.

The following is my idea. Comments are welcome:

• "Allow closing parent issue which has open subtasks"

* "Allow closing parent issue whose subtasks are open"

Toshi MARUYAMA, thank you for your contribution to writing the patch.

I agree with Go MAEDA to change the setting name to "Allow closing parent issue whose subtasks are open".

Hinako Tajima wrote:

Toshi MARUYAMA, thank you for your contribution to writing the patch.
I agree with Go MAEDA to change the setting name to "Allow closing parent issue whose subtasks are open".

This is new patch.

!issue-28492.ver.2.png!

Do you need this request? In what use cases is it necessary?

Mitsuyoshi Kawabata wrote:

Do you need this request? In what use cases is it necessary?

I think if #31322 is implemented, this feature is redundant.

Let me clear my point, I think allowing a parent issue to be closed when subtasks are still open is not really necessary.

How about just #31589 ? It would be simple and clear.

FWIW: This issue is not related/being superseded by either #31322 or #31589. See my explanation in #31589#note-21.

Regarding this feature: I tend to agree with Mitsuyoshi Kawabata that I'm not seeing clear use-cases where it is logical to have closed parent issues with open subtasks. I'd like some more feedback on this matter.

Though, if the decision is made to add this configuration option nevertheless, I'd propose the following T9N for the string @setting_close_parent_issue_whose_subtasks_are_open@: "Allow closed parent issues with open subtasks" and a similar I18n string and setting name.

Mischa The Evil wrote:

I'd propose the following T9N for the string @setting_close_parent_issue_whose_subtasks_are_open@: "Allow closed parent issues with open subtasks" and a similar I18n string and setting name.

Changed.

Rebased on trunk r19598 because r19570 caused conflict.

Some not-so-quick notes from Planio regarding this issue: r16108 was a breaking change for our existing users, some of which depended on and had built workflows around being able to have closed parent issues with open child issues. To alleviate this issue for existing users we have back ported the diff attached to this issue and enabled the setting to restore the "old" behaviour for existing users. New users will use the new behaviour by default.

We understand the need to make breaking changes sometimes, though having a setting would make that less breaking of a change for us: We could then set existing users to use the before breaking change behaviour and new users with the after breaking change behaviour.

We have discussed this matter internally in addition to already reading what has been discussed here. We also currently have no use-case for open subissues with closed parent issues, but this does not mean it is not a valid use-case. Several Planio users were impacted when we introduced this change on Planio.

We think Redmine is a very capable, malleable and configurable system and would like to contribute to keep it that way. Redmine does not impose certain types of trackers (you can configure more than just "Bug", "Feature" and "Support"), can be configured with arbitrary statuses and workflows in those statuses, Redmine can even have custom fields for issues and other things. We feel it is antithetical to the configurability of Redmine to not have a setting for this.

While thinking about this we also had an idea that might help assuage some concerns regarding this setting. We think adding this setting to trackers instead of a global setting could allow for more rich configurations and workflows in Redmine. You could then configure trackers to allow or to not allow closing when there are open subissues and vice-versa. Maybe the "inverse" setting would also be helpful: automatically closing parent issues with a certain tracker when all subissues are closed.

Thank you for reading and thank you for your work and care with Redmine.

related_issues

relates,Closed,10989,Prevent parent issue from being closed if a child issue is open

relates,New,31322,Provide a way to automatically close all open subtasks too when a parent issue is being closed

relates,Closed,31589,Show warning and the reason when the issue cannot be closed because of open subtasks or blocking open issue(s)

duplicates,Closed,31321,Option not to block closing a parent issue when its subtask is open

履歴

#1 - 2022/05/10 17:04 - Admin Redmine

- カテゴリ を Issues_2 にセット